



Accelerating Progress Towards Economic Empowerment of Rural Women in Kyrgyzstan (RWEE) 2012 - 2017

Gender Action Learning for Sustainability at Scale

Follow-up in Bishkek and Chui Province, Kyrgyzstan

Report by Linda Mayoux

FIRST DRAFT October 2016



Contents

.....	1
Part 1: Aims of the September Follow-Up Mission	3
This Report	3
Part 2: Retreat for Service Providers and meetings with CDA/UNWomen.....	5
Participants	5
Tools	5
Catalyst Tools	5
Livelihood and Value Chain Tools:	5
Organisational Vision Journeys and Multilane.....	6
Gender Review Tools.....	6
Facilitation Skills	7
Monitoring and Evaluation.....	8
Part 3 Review in Chui.....	10
1) Kaldyk Village	11
First Meeting Wednesday 21 st September.....	11
.....	13
Second Meeting Monday 26 th September	13
2) Kamashanovka Village.....	15
Kamashanovka champion meetings.....	16
Idayat.....	17
Gender issues and Islam:.....	17
Plans for future.....	18
Outreach.....	18
Begaim.....	18
Journalist: Altynai Salyamova.....	18
Meeting 2: Discussions with the men	19
Part 4: Conclusions and Plans Going Forward	20
Annex 1: Mission Schedule	21
Annex 2: RWEE Performance Monitoring Matrix with green highlight of indicators relevant to GALS	23
Annex 3: Suggested Follow Up Questions	25

Part 1: Aims of the September Follow-Up Mission

The first Catalyst process and findings of the follow-up by CDA in July are given in the first Mission Report. The aims of this second and final Mission by the international consultant to support CDA and UNWomen to implement GALS within the RWEE project were to:

- Review the findings of the CDA follow up in July. Given time constraints, it was only possible to do this in Chui near Bishkek. Chui being one of the regions where champions had been reported to be peer sharing least.
- Reinforce the learning of the service providers from CDA and UNWomen on the Catalyst process in relation to facilitation, implementation and monitoring (given that in Naryn the focus had been mostly on the community champions, not facilitation and implementation skills of service providers at that point)
- If feasible to introduce some more advanced tools for livelihoods and leadership
- On that basis to suggest an upscaling plan to the end of the project in March 2017.

In addition to there was the opportunity to share and discuss the methodology with Azzura from IFAD Rome responsible for RWEE globally, and Sarina from IFAD Kyrgyzstan responsible for IFAD livelihoods projects in the Central Asia Region so that senior IFAD people had an overview of potential uses of GALS in other IFAD projects.

The programme of the Mission is given in Appendix 1.

This Report.

This Report is based on notes by Linda Mayoux on the parts of the Mission that she conducted. As some of the meetings and activities were in parallel, particularly in Chui, and there are challenges of translation of other reports, the notes on CDA and UNWomen facilitation are with CDA and UNWomen in Kyrgyz. **At the time of writing all notes on the CDA/UNWomen sustainability plan from the Saturday debrief after Linda's departure are also with them in Kyrgyz.**

The Report complements materials to support the process that have been pasted on the blog <http://gamechangenetwork.org/asia/kyrgyzstan> :

- links to other Toolkits that can be referred to (given that there was no provision in this contract to write a tailored Toolkit for Kyrgyzstan) to clarify on the new tools introduced at the Retreat. These are Copyrighted to Linda Mayoux but with this report I give permission for these to be translated into Kyrgyz and/or adapted provided the original document is fully acknowledged and use is ethical according to Creative Commons principles. (see <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/legalcode>)
- videos of songs and Naryn Workshop Tools and process in Kyrgyz with English translation that can be used to help the champions and service providers to enliven and motivate follow-up meetings with the champions have been uploaded in format for screen (large file), tablets (medium size) and mobile (smallest) on <http://www.zemniimages.com/GameChangeNetwork/Kyrgyzstan>. On that site are also downloadable photos. Many champions are using ClassMates – the Russian equivalent of Facebook – and it is recommended that links be made from the CDA ClassMates blog and/or some of the materials downloaded from existing location and uploaded to ClassMates. There is a lot of enthusiasm by people to see themselves on the Internet. At the same time privacy

settings could also be altered on the zemniimages site to restrict viewing and download if required. I have put download protection on the materials to prevent other outside people downloading. **IF ANY MATERIALS ON KYRGYZSTAN ARE PASSWORD PROTECTED PASSWORD IS 'Naryn'.**

Other materials – toolkits, videos and songs – are available on

<http://www.galsatscale.net/Resources.html#toolkits>

Note This version is the first draft to be updated in December after CDA follow up in November. Items marked !! are queries to be filled in for the final version of this report by end December.

Part 2: Retreat for Service Providers and meetings with CDA/UNWomen

The main aim of the retreat was to strengthen the basic Catalyst Process to deepen the changes on gender, and upscale to much more widespread coverage of participants in the cooperatives and groups involved in RWEE – but if feasible including some more advanced versions of the same tools. The starting point were the opportunities identified in the first report (See Appendix 2), and reviewing and looking further at some of the challenges and how to address.

Participants

Full-time: Asel (CDA), Asyl (UNWomen), Gulmira (CDA Chui), Marat (CDA Djalalabad), Raimjan (champion from Osh who will take over the process there from Himia for CDA), Tamche (RWEE leader from Naryn who was not at the Catalyst workshop but has been very active since. She replaced Kyial the CDA Naryn coordinator who was in Australia for a conference – she has been in touch since and works closely with Tamche).

Part-time: Guljan (CDA who had other assignments in relation to some relevant research on gender), Jipara (RWEE UNWomen), Azzurra Chiarini (RWEE IFAD Rome) and Sarina Abdysheva (IFAD Central Asia).

Tools

Catalyst Tools

The Retreat started with a review of the Catalyst Tools: Visioning, Vision Journey, Gender Balance (Household Efficiency) Tree, Gender Change Diamond, Gender Challenge Action Tree. However it was clear that none of the tools were well understood by any of the service providers at the beginning of the retreat. They had forgotten and not reviewed them before the retreat. People were too used to conventional strategic planning and PRA and so had not really been concentrating so well during the Naryn workshop. Their understanding of the tools was no better than those of the champions at Naryn and some of the participants at the village meetings in Chui. This meant quite a bit of the first days of the retreat were spent reviewing the tools from Naryn. And they had to be periodically reinforced on the following days. This did however also bring home to people the difficulties the champions would also face, and removed assumptions that service providers would automatically be better at that level.

Once the basics were really understood, explaining the advanced tools was much easier – both with the service providers and in Chui (see below).

Additional Tools covered at request of CDA – for further study by CDA using the resources cited were:

Livelihood and Value Chain Tools:

These were introduced and participants took notes, and explained in detail to Gulchan who is designing these tools in RWEE.

Livelihood Vision Calendar and other types of Multilane Vision Journey Diagram adding things like savings

Increasing Incomes Challenge Action Trees and Business Trees and adding things like use of credit

Market map and value chain map

The key reference resources here are **'Growing the Diamond Forest' GENVAD Manual** and **Happy Family Happy Coffee Toolkit** on the Gamechange network blog:

<http://gamechangenetwork.org/livelihoods-and-value-chain-development>

Leadership Tools

- Leadership Visioning and Vision Journey
- Leadership/Participation Diamond
- Leadership/Participation Flower

Together with detailed review of participatory facilitation techniques.

These have yet to be documented and made publicly available – doing so is not part of this contract – but participants took their own notes in Kyrgyz.

Organisational Vision Journeys and Multilane

We discussed the New Home video and examples from Ivory Coast as ways of facilitating large organizational meetings for strategic planning.

New Home video You Tube <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e60oJtNUECs>

On an individual level, Vision Journeys can be extended as Multilane Diagrams looking at : economic, gender and peer sharing as a monitoring tool.

See:

Elizabeth Masika's Multilane Highway for Change: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SGmofAu05C0>

Gender Review Tools

The second day of the Retreat we focused on gender – particularly CEDAW – and the outcomes from the Gender Balance Tree and the Gender Challenge Action Tree at the Naryn workshop, also the discussions in Chui with Damira, Idayat and Bagaim (See Part 3 of this report).

Here there is a lot of scope for using GALS as part of other gender processes in UNWomen and with CDA and IFAD – like International Women's Day, and also the activities around Gender-based Violence in December. GALS is ideally linked to these advocacy processes.

Key resources here are:

Rocky Road to Diamond Dreams: GALS Catalyst Manual Part 3 on Gender Review

http://gamechangenetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/GALS-Catalyst-Manual-March-2014_compressed.pdf

'Diamonds are a girl's best friend' published article

<http://www.galsatscale.net/documents/GALSReportDiamondsAreAGirlsBestFriend.pdf>

Decision Diamond with Jane Walina Bukonzo Joint, You Tube Video – includes reproductive rights:

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hrbR9WjADV&feature=em-upload_owner

Facilitation Skills

Facilitation skills are in many ways more important for the change process and upscaling than the actual tools.

A lot of time was spent going through and practising facilitation, particularly the first session:

- Make sure people are properly informed, and asked to bring all their books etc from any previous meeting
- If possible have a song recorded and playing as people arrive, and put diagrams on the wall
- Think about seating beforehand – people need to be able to move and sit in circular groups
- Pairwise introduction based on key relevant questions for the process. Putting people with people they do not know so well to break up cliques and develop team feeling.
- Start on time. But politely find out why people are late. Those with good reasons should be given attention so they catch up – or other participants are asked to explain. This is good practice for the participants.
- Use interactive facilitation – people coming up. Others do individual drawings in their books.
- Practise the group participation skills – the diamond and challenge action tree with systematic feedback and quantification. Facilitators here just briefly make sure people are clear what they are doing. But then go away. In the plenary participants should always contribute first. The facilitator has a chance to ask some questions and do a short wrap up at the end.
- **THE DRAWINGS MUST STAY WITH THE GROUP** One of the big reasons why people had not continued with the group discussions in Chui was because the diagrams had been taken away. Photograph the drawings. If they really have to be taken to present at a big workshop, they should be immediately sent back.

Other guidelines for facilitation are given in:

<http://www.galsatscale.net/documents/GALSatScale0Facilitation.pdf>

Monitoring and Evaluation

In GALS Monitoring and Evaluation is one part of a bigger Gender Action Learning System. GALS brings together different stakeholders in an empowering learning process, rather than simply checking boxes for donors. It combines:

- Individual tracking of empowerment process/progress towards visions and action commitments in notebook diaries at each level: communities, private sector, organisation staff.
- Participatory quantitative monitoring and aggregation by groups and associations for collective planning.
- Participatory review by the stakeholders to decide what to do with the information
- Qualitative and multimedia methods by stakeholders, NGOs and/or external agencies for deepening understanding of processes

The MandE process for GALS is documented in a number of places:

Rocky Road to Diamond Dreams: GALS Catalyst Manual Part 3 on Gender Review

http://gamechangenetwork.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/09/GALS-Catalyst-Manual-March-2014_compressed.pdf

and

<http://www.galsatscale.net/documents/GALS0ActionLearningSystem.pdf>

There was not time at the retreat to discuss this fully, and it is probably not feasible for such a short project to set up a robust action learning system at this stage.

The focus was therefore on identifying potential indicators for the project. Annex 2 gives the list of RWEE Monitoring indicators, with main gender dimensions highlighted in Green by Azzurra and possible GALS tools to be used filled in in red by Linda. For the other indicators in the framework, the information is collected from coop or government records.

However it was the opinion of UNWomen and CDA that they wanted to collect information over a broader range – given the potential richness of gender impact information provided through the GALS tools. The first report had suggested possible indicators based on the gender diamond and topics chosen/commitments from the Challenge Action Trees and in line with women's human rights in CEDAW are:

- Men involving women in decision-making on major investments eg horses, shops etc
- Men sharing the income with women from these investments
- Men buying more presents for their wives
- Men being more faithful with fewer girlfriends
- Mothers-in-law discussing with and learning new things from daughters-in-law
- Greater affection and understanding between mothers-in-law and daughters-in-law
- Mothers-in-law and daughters-in-law having greater knowledge of and accessing the range of information on the Internet
- Daughters-in-law having cars and learning to drive

Issues of land ownership, reproductive rights and sharing of housework need further discussion.

At the Review CDA suggested a range of indicators based on CEDAW and Catalyst process, to be collected through quantification of fruits on Increasing Incomes Challenge Action Tree, Household Efficiency Tree and Multilane Calendar:

Household/perceptions

- Do women feel they are treated better – do they enjoy more respect? Particularly daughters-in-law.
- Do women participate in decision-making? Do they have a right to participate equally in decision making? And not only listened to but also control decisions?
- Has violence decreased? Against daughters-in-law? Against children? Physical violence? Psychological violence? Have cases of denigration of women decreased? Denigration of daughters-in-law? Do daughters-in-law feel safer and will not be beaten?
- Has divorce decreased?

Economic/paid and unpaid work

- Is there participatory planning of business activities?
- Is there more equal division of income.
- Do family members value unpaid work of women. Do men help with housework. Do mothers-in-law help daughters-in-law more with housework? Do men spend more time with children?
- Are women's practical gender needs met – eg stove and water, oven for bread, electric appliances.
- Do men invest in women's income activities? help as moral support and advice
- Are women less dependent on husbands?
- Have joint activities of family members increased?
- Do women have more time for leisure? Do women and men spend more time and leisure time together?

Additional from the livelihoods tools:

- Has land for production increased?
- Has production increased?
- Are women producing new products?
- Is there a sustainable market?
- Have women's business skills increased?

Leadership and social participation

- Do women face fewer barriers to participate in meetings, groups and coops? Do daughters-in-law have more freedom to go to meetings?
- Do women pay more attention to health, sports etc.
- Has time and money spent on festivities decreased.

These indicators are to be further refined by CDA/UNWomen as they implement GALS and other aspects of the project. GALS champions could be asked to systematically put details of any of these indicators on the relevant tool. In analysis there should be a distinction between those directly covered by GALS eg SHG group members, and those reached indirectly. Some thought should also be given to how to collect information from men – as they are not group members. But changes in men should also be captured.

Part 3 Review in Chui

The second part of the follow-up mission was to look at the factors involved in implementation and upscaling at the level of the community champions in the light of the plans and feedback on peer sharing, and the achievements, opportunities and challenges identified in Report 1. In particular:

- **Inequality between women:** the power inequalities between mothers-in-law and daughter-in-law.
- **Lack of trust and sharing:** reports from CDA feedback that people were not sharing in families.
- **Geographic isolation and spread** of champions outside Naryn and how champions will support each other.
- **Levels of education** and implications for adaptation of the tools eg when to draw and when to write and how complex the diagrams can be, how quickly can people move on to advanced tools?
- **Group facilitation skills:** how to improve these?
- **RWEE is women-focused**, even though many activists are men. How to involve men champions in the communities beyond activists? Particularly in view of the spread of more conservative versions of Islam?



Photo: 1 Chui Champions at Naryn workshop. Front left Idayat. Middle back left Begaim. Middle back right Damira. Front Right Gulmira from CDA.

Village		Commitment in Naryn			Achievements August CDA follow up	
		Direct	Indirect	Total	What	Direct
Kaldyk	Damira	11	33	44	Just sharing information	4 people
Kamyshanovka 1	Idayat	6	18	24	Visioning, Diamond	8 members of ASHG
Kamyshanovka 2	Begaim	6	18	24	Visioning	4 relatives
Total		25	69	94		16



1) Kaldyk Village

In Kaldyk there are 6 RWEE groups. Each have around 5 members who contribute 100 soms per month. 1 group was doing only 50 soms, but in May increased to 100 soms after seeing other groups.

This month – despite the harvest – they had several trainings already from FAO - processing tomatoes, eggplant, pepper, onion. Made salad. Fried and closed. Kitchen Garden salad. These were different trainings, attended by around 20 women each time.

Asel Asyl Guljan Gulmira Sarina Azzura Jipara Linda Gulche. We left Bishkek for Chui at 10.00 am and arrived for lunch at Damira's house.

First Meeting Wednesday 21st September

Linda was overseeing and observing facilitation by Kaldyk participants and CDA staff while talking to Damira to get more qualitative background on how the process had been going and what she saw as the ways forward. Linda was also explaining to Jipara, Sarina and Azzura what was happening.

Kaldyk Champions

28 women participants from 6 SHGs. The seating with fixed benches in rows was somewhat problematic and was not very good for group participation. As people were already seated when we arrived, it was not easy to completely rearrange things. They had not been asked first to bring books. But they did get them.

They started with a pairwise discussion of what they thought GALs was, what they had learned and who they had shared with. All had visions. Some vision journeys were good and correct. Contrary to the impression from the CDA follow-up report, outreach was good, and people had been sharing in their families (possibly after the CDA visit). The main challenge was harvest time.

Damira had reached out to 28 women. 22 were present at the first meeting in Kaldyk. Of these:

- 3 women shared the vision journey with 9 family members
- 3 women share the vision journey with 8 family members
- 1 woman shared the vision journey with 7 family members
- 2 women shared the vision journey with 5 family members
- 3 women shared the vision journey with 4 family members
- 5 women shared the vision journey with 3 family members
- 3 women shared the vision journey with 2 family members
- 1 woman shared the vision journey with 1 family member
- 1 woman didn't share the vision journey with family members

A total of 102 family members were reached by 22 women

They then split into groups with one RWEE team facilitator in each group and shared their Vision Journeys and made sure everyone was clear about the steps. (while Linda talked to Damira).

In the second half of the meeting they learned an Increasing Incomes Challenge Action Tree facilitated by RWEE team. Two groups looked at tomatoes. 1 group chose dumplings. In 1 hour they got as far as quantifying the challenge roots. They agreed to do the solution branches for homework and bring these the following week.



Damira's Vision Journey and Gender Balance Tree update and

The Vision Journey had helped her to make more concrete plans for her crops. Land is in the man's name because he is 'head of household'. But government titles give 0.7? hectares for each family member and the husband can only sell his part. The big change for her that has enabled her to move forward is that her son has now come home to stay at home for good. He lives only 30 minutes away but in 9 years he had not come back. His wife is not good. She and her family used to beat him. Now she wants to get him married to someone else in this village. He has been doing all the house repairs, on the farm etc.

On the Gender Balance Tree her commitments were on increasing crops and reducing luxury expenditure. She has done that. But harvests this year were not so good because of rain. She shared the Gender Balance Tree Tool with her husband and he did his own. He promised to give up cigarettes. As far as she knows he has done that and has not smoked in front of her since.

New Tool: Multilane Livelihood Vision Calendar

Linda showed Damira how to design a Multilane Livelihood Vision Calendar (a type of Vision Journey) for planning work and income for different crops. It was possible for Damira to understand this very quickly – about 10 minutes – from her knowledge of the basic Vision Journey. She completed this at home, and presented it well at the leader's meeting and also the following Champion meeting in Kaldyk (see video). Damira already knows most things she is putting on the diagram and already had plans, but the tool really helps her to put all her thoughts together on one diagram. One of the main things she wants to save up for over time is to go on a holiday in Hawaii.

Chui Leaders Meeting

Damira presented this tool at the Chui leaders meeting, and the other leaders were also interested in learning this tool.



Second Meeting
Monday 26th
September

This meeting was a practice in ‘facilitation’ for CDA, as well as a meeting for the Kaldyk participants.

There were new people at this meeting (how many?). The participants from the previous week had already met in the meantime and put stickers on for the two tomato groups combined. Some people brought this to the meeting to present, but one tomato group did not come. From the dumpling group only 2 people came.

We started again with a pairwise discussion, where champions from the previous meeting showed the Vision Journey to new people while everyone arrived. (Estimate everyone has arrived about 30 minutes after allotted time - need to tighten up on discipline)

Damira presented her Multilane Livelihood Vision Journey (see video).

Then the women participants divided into their groups and explained the Challenge Action Tree to new people. The participants discussed the solutions and their commitments.



Discussions with men

Parallel to the women's process Raimjan and Marat explained the Vision Journey to two men. Partly to give them practice in facilitation, and so they were not listening to the women's discussions – ideally men work with men and women with women where there might be any sensitive gender issues.

One of the men wanted a definition of GALS because he said he was interested in gender. He gave a good short definition of gender as 'relationships between women and men as equal human beings'. He had been learning about gender from the Internet. For his Vision Journey he decided to work on a Vision for getting a flat Bishkek. But Marat was not able to make the tool work for him because he did not separate out activities, just divided the total money into what he had to save each month. This was an issue to do either as a multilane showing how the different activities he is involved in could contribute. He was not willing to draw – but things could have been done through writing. There was no gender analysis. This example was discussed with the CDA staff at the retreat.

The second man with Raimjan did a multilane livelihood VJ. He only got to his second second lane before he had to leave because he was doing very detailed (necessary) calculations, and there was no gender analysis. But he had not done any sort of planning like this before and found it useful.

Journalist and social networking

There was also a young journalist filming the meeting from CDA documentation training for their Classmates blog (Russian Facebook). We discussed how this could be useful for the GALS process. She had learned how to frame pictures and received a tablet. But Internet has only just arrived and this was her first assignment. Earlier her mother wanted her to stop school and help her at home. But she has now decided she wants to finish her education in town and become a journalist.

2) Kamashanovka Village

Before the meeting we had a courtesy meeting with the village leader (**designation??**)

The village was started by immigrants from Russia, Ukraine and Kazakhstan. Many of the Russians and Ukrainians have returned after the break up of the Soviet Union, but the population continues to be very mixed population with further immigration from Tajikistan and Uzbekistan. There is some split between Tajiks and Uzbeks, many of whom are promoting a more fundamentalist version of Islam, and more liberal Kyrgyz people. Not everyone knows each other (see case of the two men below)

According to the administrative head (**what is his designation??**), the village has about 500 households with 2,500 people. Of these 29 are classed as vulnerable, with 12 in extreme poverty ie income per month less than 800 som (**? Or USD**) For 5-6 people. The economy is mostly agricultural growing wheat and barley and livestock - mostly cows, sheep and pigs. Agricultural season is March to October. Winters are very cold at minus 25-30C and it snows daily. Some men migrate in the winter for work in countries like Turkey (see below).

UN women has been a big help. Before they grew mainly wheat and barley just for fodder, now they are growing vegetables and these are more profitable. They have also developed kitchen gardens and given training on agricultural techniques. Women work mainly in irrigated land. Cabbage pepper and maize are profitable.

Irrigation is a challenge for improvement - of 6500 hectares, 1500 is irrigated conventionally with pumps and 478 hectares with channels from river Chu. Irrigation channels were constructed by Soviets but not well-maintained, and people are diverting the water. There was drought for 3 years, then this year was very heavy rain. Last year barley was 500kg per hectare barley, this year 1500kg.

There will be elections to the local council. UNWomen are conducting a 2 day election training by 25th Nov.

One of the main purposes of local government is to provide sustainable income. They have a Strategic Plan to 2030. Main objective to help farmers to help themselves. Previously they had 39 vulnerable families. In Soviet times they used to use summer pastures in the mountains. Now they can't do that so village pastures need to be improved. They are trying to support people organising into cooperatives for different crops. Starting in 2017 the coops will sell agricultural produce and help with marketing.

The leader (**position??**) had South Korean friends who wanted to help and set up a livestock project for 2-3 years. The buy 5 sheep for each vulnerable family, then the next season sheep transferred to another family. A social committee selects and monitors. Priority is given to large families and single women. They already have in mind the next family, so monitors make sure they don't sell. 1 family got 1 pedigree cow, but a cow takes too long to produce and the woman sold the cow to a neighbor because she wanted a smaller cow that needed less forage.

In what follows Linda was interviewing the champions to review what was happening, their ideas for scaling up etc. Then in the second meeting with Marat, Raimjan and the men – again to see options for scaling up and involving men. Information on the discussions with the women is with CDA staff in Kyrgyz.



Kamashanovka champion meetings

Meeting 1: 22nd September

The first meeting was attended by 20-30?? Women? The meeting was much more ethnically mixed than at Kaldyk. One woman only spoke Russian.

How many had done the methodology before?

We started with pairwise discussion. Then people shared their Vision Journeys. Most of the first meeting was around clarification of the vision journeys.

Does anyone have more on this? I was letting CDA practice facilitation – just observing what was happening - while I talked to Idayat and Begaim on gender issues in the community, how they had followed up and their thoughts for scaling up.

Meeting 2: 27th September

There were fewer women. About half were the same as meeting 1 and half were different.

We had planned to do the Gender Justice Diamond, but Idayat could not find it. Begaim was not there because she had gone to another village for work.

The champions shared their Vision Journeys with the others and discussed between themselves.

Then CDA staff facilitated the Household Efficiency Tree.

Does anyone have more on this? I was letting CDA practice facilitation – just observing what was happening - while I talked to the men and discussed how men might work with men, and to the journalist.



Idayat



Photo: 2 Idayat's Household Efficiency Tree

Idayat had liked the Vision journey in Naryn, also the Happy Family Tree.

We focused on the Happy Family/Household Efficiency Tree (see photo left). This was a good tree and she had made good commitments. But there was no analysis of ownership and decision-making -time in Naryn had been short. Her husband had also done his tree when she got back (not clear if he had circled on her suggestions in her notebook? There are 10 green fruits not 5). She had not yet circled in red, though some things had been achieved.

On the work roots:

Her side: wanted to increase number livestock, poultry, establish sewing shop.

Both: Increase livestock and work together on agricultural land. Of these they have increased poultry, and dairy goats managed by shepherd.

On the expenditure branches:

Both: Construction of bathhouse and shop. Purchase a vehicle – her husband used to drive a big van but they could not buy it. She used to drive when husband had a van. Her husband had taught her.

Her side: to buy clothes but this did not happen.

Her husband stopped drinking – but had already reduced because he had become more religious (see below).

Gender issues and Islam:

15-20% men have girlfriends (in Kyrgyzstan generally). Better-off men have more than one wife. The first is an official marriage, the second in the mosque. The 3rd and 4th wife have no formal recognition. Women accept to do this because there are few young men. Men die early because of alcohol, prison, drugs. Migration of men is mostly in the South. (this all needs verifying CDA staff doubted that later wives did not have nikah marriage).

Currently many are stopping drink, drugs and crime because of Islam. Many men in the village have done this over the last 2-3 years because of preaching by the Imams.

Previously was arranged marriage. Idayat chose her own husband, and they eloped as a form of customary kidnap. Her parents then said yes.

Her husband has become much more religious. But this has been a good thing. Her husband does not restrict her. He says she is responsible to god in afterlife. The main things are not to be unfaithful, to wear modest clothes (Kyrgyz kerchief – he is not against make up). Men also should also do the same.

Obeying God means being honest, not to lie, drink alcohol, keep the house clean. He is supportive of her work in the SHGs and community and standing for the local council.

Plans for future

This year they want to move and build new house. Her husband is working in Bishkek so life is difficult. All her relatives are also near Bishkek. If she moves she will not give up GALs, she will take it with her and teach people there.

She is also standing for election to the local council. She was thinking of that before GALs - she likes mixing with people. It was one of the reasons she wanted to go to Naryn training.

Outreach

She had done the Visioning and Gender Justice Diamond. It went well. The things women liked least were gossiping and fighting between mother in law and daughter in law. But she has lost the diagram they did (I had hoped she could present it in the meetings with the participants as the basis for a challenge action tree)

Young women are in the field at the moment because of harvest. But they normally come.

In SHG she would like to increase the number of members. There are many unemployed women and she would like to help them to earn money. Bakery and sewing shops are good possibilities here. Clothes can be sold in Bishkek. Farming is almost all organic and that also has a market.

Begaim

Begaim has not been very active – her mother is good friend of Idayat. She has been working over the summer in another village.

Her Vision is to establish a sewing shop. First she is going to study tailoring next month in Bishkek. She had this idea before GALs. She had thought of hair dressing, but her parents opposed this because cutting hair is against Islam – it is seen as unlucky.

Her father is very religious. He is trying to make everyone wear more hejab (ie closely cover the hair tight around the face with a long scarf (see picture of Begaim above). But she is the only one obeying him. Her mother and sisters only wear the Kyrgyz kerchief.

She will choose her own husband. Girls here usually marry at 16-17, though legally is 18. She is 18.

Journalist: Altynai Salyamova

Confident young woman from the village. She wants to become a journalist and study many languages. She videoed an interview from Linda (translated by Gulche) giving overview on GALs and said she would put it on CDA Classmates Blog (to be followed up – could be useful).

Meeting 2: Discussions with the men

Again Raimjan and Marat were facilitating men. Of the men invited, two men came from different parts of the village. They did not know each other – indicating that separate communities maintain separate ‘gossip’ networks even for men. That is important in how men might organize and contact each other.

Man 1 Kyrgyz from Tadjikistan. He was there with his son and had to leave early because the son got restless. He did the Household Efficiency Tree (I do not have details of this). His wife is at home and member. He found the tool interesting but did not get as far as fruits on the Tree.

Man 2 Kyrgyz from this area. He loves his wife very much. His Household Efficiency Tree analysis was quite equal in terms of expenditure. His wife is at home three children and baby. The children here go to preschool around 3 years, school at 7. Then will work as a cook as she did before and get good money? (it was unclear whether this would be in the village or Bishkek - big Bishkek restaurants pay 3000 dollars a month. 15-20000 som in small restaurants). They moved back recently from Bishkek. The land currently belongs to his father and he will inherit that. Women do not get any inheritance. (It is unclear what happens to the government allocation)

Then he did a Multilane Livelihood Vision Calendar. He is planning to go to Turkey for a few months to earn some money. His friend went last year for first time and had good experience.

We then discussed about setting up a men’s network – he knows Idayat and she came to join the discussion. According to him 80% of men who are religious were controlling their wives more. He thought that is very wrong and a man’s group would be good. He said he would contact the other man to discuss, and Idayat would give him the name.

The next meeting for the group was fixed for after the harvest at end October.

Part 4: Conclusions and Plans Going Forward

Some of the main achievements from the Retreat and Chui Review were:

- Clarification on the basic GALS tools and different between Vision Journey and normal strategic planning
- Clarification on facilitation process – what is meant by facilitation from the back and ‘facipulation’, that good GALS facilitation means saying as little as possible oneself but engineering things (through seating arrangements, group organization and leaving participants alone, and constant observation) so that what needs to be said is said by participants. Though time is also a factor.
- Realisation by service providers that the champions can indeed facilitate if they themselves learn how to listen and support this

At the end of the Retreat the CDA staff started to prepare a Plan. This was done in the form of a Multilane Vision Journey – a GALS Strategic Plan Tool that people found useful.

!!!Do you have a photograph of the final output?? Together with narrative

This was further elaborated on the Saturday after Linda left. Those details are still with CDA in Kyrgyz.

The Plan as far as understood is to:

Do the next set of follow-up in November after receiving this Report. This will:

- Reinforce the basic GALS tools – moving on from Vision Journeys to Household Efficiency Trees
- Reinforce champion facilitation skills through the Diamonds and Challenge Action Trees
- Introduce the livelihoods tools
- Use the questions in Annex 4 to do some follow – up. This should be done supportively and capture more of the outreach.
- Look at how men can be brought in
- Do a new outreach plan with the champions in each place

A big opportunity to be explored for upscaling is the use of social networking and the CDA Classmates blog.

More here will be added in December after receiving information from the November follow up and translations of materials from Kyrgyz.

Annex 1: Mission Schedule

Date	Activity	Details	Participants
19th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule Bishkek team meeting	10.00 – 12.30 recap of catalyst tools and update 1.30 – 5.00 linda overview of GALS, livelihoods and value chain tools and planning	Asel, Asyl, Linda, Gulche. Gulmira was sick
20th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule Bishkek team meeting	9.00 – 10.30 recap of facilitation of visioning 11.00 – 12.30 discussion on ifad programmes, value chain and planning and logistics for Chui 1.30 – 5.00 review of vision journey, gender balance tree and gender challenge action tree by CDA explanation of increasing incomes challenge action tree by Linda Clarifications on facilitation process in Chui	Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Sarina, Azzura, Jipara, Linda, Gulche
21st Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule review Chui 1 Kaldyk: Damira	Individual vision Journey recap and Challenge Action Tree for increasing incomes part 1	28 women participants at meeting from 6 SHGs. Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Sarina, Azzura, Jipara, Linda, Gulche
22nd Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule review Chui 2 Kamashanovka: Idayat	Individual vision Journey	20+ women participants??Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Sarina, Azzura, Jipara, Linda, Gulche
23rd Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule CDA retreat	Recap of basic tools: Vision Journey, Gender Balance Tree	Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Azzura, Linda, Gulche

24th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat	Gender CEDAW; Gender balance tree; Working with men; Gender diamond	Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Azzura, Linda, Gulche
25th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat	Livelihood Tools: Multilane, increasing incomes cat. Business tree	Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Azzura, Linda, Gulche
26th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat: Chui 1 Kaldyk	Challenge Action Tree for increasing incomes Part 2. Meeting with men. Facilitation Skills.	20+ women and 3 men participants?? Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Azzura, Linda, Gulche
27th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat: Chui 2 Kamashanovka	Challenge Action Tree for increasing incomes. Meeting with men. Facilitation Skills.	20+ women and 3 men participants?? Asel, Asyl, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Azzura, Linda, Gulche
28th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat	Morning: feedback and recap on facilitation. Discussion with Jipara and Sarina on value chain. Afternoon: going to scale: facilitating large meetings eg Cote divoire 5-6 Clarification for Gulchan on livelihoods tools. 6-7.30 Chui Leadership meeting	Asel, Asyl, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Linda, Gulche
29th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat	Going to Scale and adapting the core tools. Gender upscaling: Violence diamond; Livelihoods upscaling: Market map to value chain. Leadership tools and facilitation recap.	Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Linda, Gulche
30th Sept	Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA retreat	MandE Process Vision Multilane Vision Journey Sustainability planning	Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Linda, Gulche, Jipara
1st Oct	Annex 1: Mission Schedule Annex 1: Mission Schedule	CDA internal Debrief		Asel, Asyl, Guljan, Gulmira, Marat, Raimjan, Tamche, Jipara

Annex 2: RWEE Performance Monitoring Matrix with green highlight of indicators relevant to GALS

Performance Indicator	Means of verification - (<i>Data source: how will it be measured?</i>)
	Possible GALS Tools
% of decrease in the number of undernourished population in target areas	This would have needed the GALS Food Security Diamond. But being collected through government figures? Disaggregate women (m-in-l, d-in-law) children etc.
% of rural women owning land (individually or jointly with men) out of agricultural land owners	This can be collected through local authorities, crosschecked against GALS champions, differentiated by direct/indirect. Or by ensuring that land ownership is clearly indicated on the gender balance trees, and followed up. Issue of land ownership is not straightforward – difference between registered land (0.7 ha per family member) where people can only sell their share, and ideas of ownership and title names. It is also unclear how government allocation relates to inheritance laws, particularly in polygamous families.

Performance Indicator	Means of verification (Data source)
1.1 % of increase of agricultural production of women farmers	Can be collected by crop from the Livelihood Multilane Vision Calendars.
1.2 Women dietary diversity or Household food consumption patterns (% of increase over baseline)	

Key Output 1.1

Rural women have increased access to resources, assets and services critical for their food and

Performance Indicator	Means of verification (Data source)
1.1.1 Number of rural women's groups/cooperatives accessing credit (% of	

increase over baseline)	
1.1.2 Number of rural women accessing integrated agriculture-nutrition services	
1.1.3 Number of rural women utilising improved production techniques (% of increase over baseline)	Women could be asked to put this information on the Livelihood Multilane Vision Calendars.

Indicators	Means of verification (Data source)
2.1 Variation of women/women groups/cooperatives income generated from their sales to WFP and other markets (% of baseline)	
2.2 Proportion of rural women with empowerment in the income domain of the WEAI (control over use of income)	From the Gender Balance Trees.

Annex 3: Suggested Follow Up Questions

The aim of the follow up is not only to extract impact information, but also to reinforce the tools and clarify the steps. All champions should have the basic steps for each tool (without their own information) at the back of the notebook for reference. This should be clearly drawn and separated from the writing so that it is recorded in peoples' visual memory.

Catalyst tools:

Vision journey – what was the vision – including ownership, what have they achieved, what were the opportunities, what were the challenges, what is their plan now?

Household Efficiency Tree - what were the things they wanted to change – roots, branches, ownership/decision-making? what have they achieved, what is their plan now?

Peer sharing - who did they plan to share with? what have they achieved? What tools did they share with whom? What was easy? What was difficult? what is their plan now? What tips can they suggest for others?

General issues on GALS

What are the main things they like about GALS

What are the main achievements they value most?

What things do they think could be improved? What are their suggestions for doing this?

How would they persuade other people to join?

Further points

Do they have access to social network sites like Classmates? Can they upload information there? Make links and develop a dissemination process.

The Notebooks should be photographed. If possible also interviews could be recorded on smart phone. The best champions could have their cases uploaded to Classmates.